

NOSB Meeting Summary of Minutes -- Wednesday, May 21, 2008

Taken by Katrina Heinze, NOSB Secretary

Location:

Holiday Inn-Inner Harbor
Chesapeake Ballroom
301 W. Lombard Street
Baltimore, MD

NOSB Attendance – Barry Flamm, Daniel Giacomini, Gerald Davis, Hubert Karreman, Jeffrey Moyer, Jennifer Hall, Joseph Smillie, Julie Weisman, Katrina Heinze, Kevin Engelbert, Kristine (Tina) Ellor, Rigoberto Delgado, Steve DeMuri, Tracy Miedema

NOP Attendance – Barbara Robinson, Richard Mathews, Mark Bradley, Valerie Frances, Katherine Benham, Toni Strother, Bob Pooler, Shannon Nally

Call to order – 11:07 am Eastern Time (36th meeting of NOSB)

Approval of agenda

- Move to accept agenda KH
- 2nd JM
- 14 Yes, 0 No Absent 1

Announcements

- Bea James cannot attend due to personal reasons
- Reminder to public to sign registration book

Introductions

- NOSB – HK, KE, JH, SD, JW, DG, KH, RD, JM, GD, TE, TM, JS,
- NOP – BR (also introduced rest of staff), VF

NOSB Mission – RD reviewed for public and board

Secretary's Report

- KH Motion to accept November 2007 Meeting Transcripts
- Second – TE
- Yes 14 No 0 Absent 1

- KH Motion to accept November 2007 Meeting Minutes (noted that due to a technical error the Executive Committee has not voted to accept the Vote Summary so we will not be voting to accept the vote summary today)
- Second JM
- Yes 14 No 0 Absent 1

NOP Update – Barbara Robinson

- Welcome to Dr. Barry Flamm with presentation of plaque and appointment letter
- Good things this year – budget increased, FY08 budget increase was almost 100% with an increase to \$2.6 million.
- Last November said we were going to increase transparency, with budget able to do so. The changes made are:
 - create structure in program (3 Branches, Standards (Rick Mathews), Accreditation (Mark Bradley), Compliance (vacant)). Trying to staff to 15 to 16 people this year. Until fully staffed, Accreditation and Compliance are collaborating.

NOSB Meeting Summary of Minutes -- Wednesday, May 21, 2008

Taken by Katrina Heinze, NOSB Secretary

- o Upgrade website which allowed for better transparency (publish anything that they can publish), NOP-AQSS (Q&A for questions from outside parties)
- Equivalence discussions with Canada. Two meetings with Canada held so far. Third is scheduled.
- Japan – Given Letter of Recognition so one step closer to equivalence.
- EU equivalence also in the works
- Materials dockets are moving through clearance
- Pasture still working its way through process
 - o Questions
 - Pasture what will it look like KE
 - BR – It will meet everyone’s needs
 - Will it look like NOSB recommendation KE
 - BR Yes
- Question from KE – What is the status of Origin of livestock
 - o BR -- It is being drafted
- Question from JS – What is the timing on compliance branch head
 - o BR -- this summer

Break 11:37, Resume @ 1:04 pm eastern time

Public Comments –

- Review of public comment process by RD

Speaker	Association	Questions / Comments
Ed Maltby	Northeast Organic Dairy Processors Association	HK, KE, HK
Charlotte Vallaey	proxy for Mark Castel, Cornucopia Institute	HK, TM, RD, TM
Newt Comb	Intervet	None
Patty Lovera	Food & Water Watch	JH, JS, JH, HK
Harriet Behar	MOSES, proxy for Joe Mendelson, Center for Food Safety	JM, GD
George Lockwood	Aquaculture Working Group	JM, DG, KE, DG, JH, KE, JS, KE
George Leonard	Ocean Conservancy	JS, HK
Becky Goldberg	Environmental Defense	HK, GD, JM, JS
Tom Hutcheson	proxy for Neil Sims, Kona Blue	DG
Barbara Blakistone	National Fisheries Institute	JS
Jim Riddle	Organic Outreach Coordinator, University of Minnesota – with a proxy for Alex Stone	KE, DG, JS, DG
Tom Hutcheson	Organic Trade Association	None
Jody Biergiel	CCOF	JS, SD, BR, KE, BR

Break @ 3:08 pm, Resume @ 3:24 pm

NOSB Meeting Summary of Minutes -- Wednesday, May 21, 2008

Taken by Katrina Heinze, NOSB Secretary

Public Comment

Speaker	Association	Questions / Comments
Emily Brown-Rosen	PCO	KH, DG, GD, DG
Gwendolyn Wyard	Oregon Tilth	SD
MJ Marshall	Flavor & Extracts Manufacturers Association	Barbara Robinson, JS
Grace Marroquin	Marroquin International	JS, GD, (Richard Seigel, counsel to Marroquin International), KH, DG
David E Adams	Savoury Systems	none
Kelly Shea	WhiteWave	JS, Barbara Robinson (status of Origin of Livestock will skip ANPR and go straight to proposed rule), JH
Zea Sonnabend	With proxy for Claudia Reid California Certified Organic Farmers	TM, KH, GD, KE
Charlotte Valleys	Cornucopia	HK, RD, GD,
Jim Pierce	Oregon Tilth	None
Liana Hoodes	National Organic Coalition	SD
Kristy Korb	Miles McAlvoy, National Association of State NASOP	none
Marc Cool	Seeds of Change	GD, JS

Break @ 5:04 pm, Resume @ 5:16 pm

Public Comment

Speaker	Association	Questions / Comments
Pat Kane	Accredited Certifiers Association	JS
Woody Deryckx	Organic Seed Growers and Trade Association	JS, JM, GD, KE, JH, DG
Becky Goldberg	Keep Antibiotics Working Coalition	None
Taw Richardson	AgroSource	HK, GD
Brian Baker	OMRI	KH, JW
Julia Sabin	Smuckers, OTA President	
Patrick Arndt	PCO, proxy for Melanie Saffer	None
Peggy Miars	California Certified Organic Farmers	None
Sam Welsch	One-Cert	JS, DG, KE
Katherine DiMatteo	IFOAM	None
Harriet Behar	National Organic Coalition	None
Leslie Zuck	PCO	JW
David Guggenheim	Aquaculture Developments, One Planet One Ocean	HK

NOSB Meeting Summary of Minutes -- Wednesday, May 21, 2008

Taken by Katrina Heinze, NOSB Secretary

Recess @ 6:46 pm until 8 am Wednesday, May 21

NOSB Attendance – Barry Flamm, Daniel Giacomini, Gerald Davis, Hubert Karreman, Jeffrey Moyer, Jennifer Hall, Joseph Smillie, Julie Weisman, Katrina Heinze, Kevin Engelbert, Kristine (Tina) Ellor, Rigoberto Delgado, Steve DeMuri, Tracy Miedema

NOP Attendance – Barbara Robinson, Richard Mathews, Mark Bradley, Valerie Frances, Katherine Benham, Toni Strother, Bob Pooler, Shannon Nally

Call to order @ 8:03 am

NOSB Committee Presentations and Discussions

- Policy -- BF
 - Policy & Procedures Manual – Proposed revisions – BF, HK
 - NOSB New Member Guide – Proposed revisions -- HK
 - Recommendation History – Valerie Frances
 - Questions & Discussion – Richard Mathews, HK, DG, TE, RD, Bob Pooler, KE, BF, JH, JM
- Materials – DG
 - NOSB Materials Review Process – DG
 - Questions & Discussion – JW, Barbara Robinson
 - Presentation by the Materials Working Group – Kim Dietz, Gwendolyn Wyard
 - Questions & Discussion – DG, KH, JM, HK, Brian Baker (OMRI), JS
- Compliance, Accreditation, and Certification – JS
 - Multi-Site Operation Certification – TM
 - Questions & Discussion – JH, BF, TM, KH, JS, DG

Break @ 10:01 am, Resume @ 10:12 am

- Joint Crops and Compliance, Accreditation, and Certification Committee – JS & GD
 - Commercial Availability Guidance for Organic Seed
 - Questions & Discussion – JM, KE, JH, TE, JW, GD
- Crops – GD
 - Petitioned Materials
 - Tetracycline
 - Questions & Discussion – Taw Richardson (petitioner), TE, JM, Bob Pooler (NOP), DG, HK
 - Cheesewax
 - Questions & Discussion – TE, SD, KH
 - Dextrin
 - Questions & Discussion – DG
 - Sunset 2008 Materials
 - Questions & Discussion – none
 - Hydroponics
 - Questions & Discussion – SD, JS

NOSB Meeting Summary of Minutes -- Wednesday, May 21, 2008

Taken by Katrina Heinze, NOSB Secretary

- Joint Crops and Livestock Committee
 - Aquatic Plants -- JM
 - Questions & Discussion – JS, JM, JW, DG
- Livestock – HK
 - Fenbendazole
 - Questions & Discussion – DG, HK, GD, JM, SD, Richard Mathews (NOP), RD
 - Methionine --
 - Questions & Discussion – GD, HK, Dr. Goldstein (Michael Fields Agricultural Institute), JS, HK, RD, TM, , DG

Break 11:50 am, Resume @ 1:09 pm

- Livestock (continued) – HK
 - Aquaculture – Fish Feed
 - Minority Opinion – DG
 - Questions & Discussion – JM, DG, JS, Barbara Robinson (NOP), Richard Mathews (NOP), KE, KH, HK, JW, TE, George Lockwood (Aquaculture Working Group)
 - Aquaculture – Net Pens
 - Questions & Discussion – none
- Handling
 - Introduction of Materials for Review – JW
 - Questions & Discussion – none
 - Petitioned Materials for 205.606
 - Marsala Wine & Sherry Wine – TM
 - Questions & Discussion – JM, JW, TM, RD, JH
 - Chinese Thistle Root Extract, Peony Root Extract, Polygala Root Extract, Polygonum Root Extract & Tangerine Peel Extract – KH
 - Questions & Discussion – HK
 - Condonopsis Root Extract, Jujube Fruit Extract, Ligusticum Root Extract, Poria Fungus Extract, Rehmannia Root Extract – SD
 - Questions & Discussion – none
 - Camu Camu Extract Powder – GD
 - Questions & Discussion – none
 - Caramel Color, Seaweed (Kombu) & Okra – JS
 - Questions & Discussion – JW, DG, TM, SD, GD, JS
 - Ginger Root Powdered Extract, Pectin (Low-Methoxy, Non-Amidated), Tragacanth Gum – JW
 - Questions & Discussion – Valerie Frances (NOP), Bob Pooler (NOP), SD
 - Sunset Materials for 205.605 and 205.606 – JW
 - Reaffirmation for 205.605a and 205.605b
 - Questions & Discussion – none
 - Tartaric Acid for 205.605a and 205.605b

NOSB Meeting Summary of Minutes -- Wednesday, May 21, 2008

Taken by Katrina Heinze, NOSB Secretary

- Questions & Discussion – KH, DG, JW, JM

Break @ 3:14 pm, Resume @ 3:33 pm

Public Comment on NOSB Action & Discussion Items

Speaker	Association	Questions / Comments
Marty Mesh	Florida Organic Growers with proxy	TE, TM
Chris Pierce Dave Martinelli David Bruce David Will	Heritage Poultry Management Systems Coleman Natural Foods Organic Valley Chino Valley Ranchers All with Methionine Working Group	GD, KH, KE, TM, HK, Valerie Frances (NOP), JM, DG, Bob Pooler (NOP), Richard Mathews (NOP), GD, JS
Other poultry producers	Susan Mitchell Earl Ray Zimmerman Denis Martin Lavere Stump Matthew King Ryan Rank Tom Friend Denise Miller Steve Smelter	
Eric Gingerich	Univ of Pennsylvania	none
Walter Goldstein	Michael Fields Agricultural Institute	JS, GD, SD, DG
Brian Baker	OMRI, as proxy for Dave DeCou	KH, JS, DG, KE, JW
Katherine DiMatteo	Wolf, DiMatteo, Associates as proxy for Blue River Hybrids	JS
David Bailey	General Mills	RD, JW, JS, JM
Kim Deitz with Grace Gershuny	Smuckers Quality Beverage and co-chair of OTA Multi-Site Task Force	JS, DG, Bob Pooler (NOP), KH
Nicole Dehne	Vermont Organic Farmers	HK, KE, DG
Sue Baird	QAI	none
Sebastian Belle		HK, DG, JH, Mark Bradley (NOP), RD
Dave Carter	National Bison Association	DG, KH, JW

Recess @ 6:44 pm until 8 am Thursday, May 22

NOSB Meeting Summary of Minutes -- Thursday, May 22, 2008

Taken by Katrina Heinze, NOSB Secretary

NOSB Attendance – Barry Flamm, Daniel Giacomini, Gerald Davis, Hubert Karreman, Jeffrey Moyer, Jennifer Hall, Joseph Smillie, Julie Weisman, Katrina Heinze, Kevin Engelbert, Kristine (Tina) Ellor, Rigoberto Delgado, Steve DeMuri, Tracy Miedema

NOP Attendance – Barbara Robinson, Richard Mathews, Mark Bradley, Valerie Frances, Katherine Benham, Toni Strother, Bob Pooler, Shannon Nally

Call to order @ 8:01 am

Public Comment

Speaker	Association	Questions / Comments
Lynn Coody	Wild Farm Alliance	KE, JS, JM, GD, BF, HK
Emily Brown-Rosen	Pennsylvania Certified Organic	DG, GD, KE, HK
Leslie Zuck	Chair of Accredited Certifiers Association, proxy for Seth Palmer	HK, JS, KE, Richard Mathews (NOP)
Kelly Shea	Soy Foods Association of North America with proxy for Nancy Chapman	DG
Susan Bassi	AgriCoat	none
Jim Pierce	Trout farmer with proxy for Dick Martin	none
Caren Wilcox	OTA	JS
Alexis Baden-Meyer	OCA	JS, Barbara Robinson (NOP)
Bonnie Wideman	Midwest Organic Services Association	JW
John Foster	Earthbound Farm	GD, JS
Cissy Bowman	Indiana Certified Organic	JS, DG, TE
Marty Mesh	Florida Organic Growers	none

Break @ 10:03 am, Resume @ 10:21am

NOSB Consideration and Vote on Committee Action Items – See Vote Summary

Break at 12:08 pm, Resume @ 1:11 pm for NOSB Consideration and Vote

Break @ 2:47 pm, Resume @ 3:09 pm

Committee Work Plans

- Livestock – HK
 - Aquaculture
 - Fish meal/fish oil
 - Net pens
 - Bivalves
 - Animal Husbandry
 - Poultry – outdoor access
 - Materials

NOSB Meeting Summary of Minutes -- Thursday, May 22, 2008

Taken by Katrina Heinze, NOSB Secretary

- Handling -- JW
 - Clarification of definitions on the NL w/ Materials Committee
 - Pet Food Standards
 - Petitioned materials
 - 605 calcium from seaweed, propionic acid, sodium chlorite, yeast
 - 606 chlorella, dumontiaceae, black pepper extract, buck hull powder, orange pulp, pectin LM, non-amidated
 - 606 procedures
 - Materials for sunset
 - Flavor guidance
 - Food contact substance
 - Fortification of food
- Materials DG
 - Petitioned materials
 - Finding old board deferred petitions that need to be finished
 - Sunset items
 - Clarification of definitions on the NL w/ Handling Committee
 - 606 procedures
 - Updating procedures in NOSB Policy Manual with the Policy Committee
- Crops
 - Materials
 - Organic seed
 - Soilless growing
 - Mushroom standard
 - Biodiversity compliance information
 - Discussion – SD, JS,
- CAC – JS
 - Multisite
 - Organic seed
 - Biodiversity w/ crops
 - 100% claim in regulation
 - Discussion – DG, TM, JS, RD
- Policy – BF
 - Procedures for handling public comment at meetings
 - Review TAP procedures
 - Clarify sunset procedures in policy manual
 - Preamble use and content (in recommendations) instructions for policy manual
 - Clarification and guidance on committee workplans
 - New member guide update with new NOP site
 - NOP member training to be included
 - Election procedures for NOSB officers
 - Technical correction procedures and priorities
 - Discussion – Valerie Frances, HK

NOSB Meeting Summary of Minutes -- Thursday, May 22, 2008

Taken by Katrina Heinze, NOSB Secretary

Other Business & Closing Remarks – RD

- Discussions – JS, JM,

Move to Adjourn

Motion JM, Second HK

Adjourn @ 5:01 pm

Minutes approved by Executive Committee on –

Motion: Katrina Heinze Second: Barry Flamm – yes -7; no-0; absent - 2